## OKTAVIAN Activation Cross Sections in EXFOR (A37)

(N. Otsuka, 2015-08-25, Memo 4C-3/398)

NRDC 2015 Action 37 (Otsuka): Summarize the duplication pairs in the EXFOR entries listed in the item 3b of WP2013-17 (D-T neutron activation cross sections from OKTAVIAN, Osaka Univ.).

As I presented in the NRDC 2012 and 2013 meeting, neutron activation cross sections measured at the Osaka University OKTAVIAN facility have been often compiled from preliminary and final publications without assessment of their relations. Consequently both preliminary and final data sets of more than 100 reactions are active in EXFOR, and some EXFOR users plot them in their publications as if they are independent each other (e.g., Figs .4-7 of Junhua Luo et al., Phys. Rev. C89(2014)014604).
In order to solve this duplication and even triplication problems, these pairs were checked with the authors, and the final data set was identified for each case.
Table 1 summarizes all relevant publications (including preliminary ones), Table 2 summarizes all pairs with necessary actions, and Table 3 summarizes flags used in Table 2. NEA Data Bank is invited to do necessary corrections. All corrections are also registered in the EXFOR Feedback List.

I am deeply grateful to Prof. Kiyoshi Kawade, Michihiro Shibata (Nagoya Univ.) and their colleagues for their cross-checking with patience over the last several years.

Addition to Memo 4C-3/398: All necessary corrections have been already done by NEA DB. There are still some preliminary data, and an article for their final data is under preparation by Dr. N. Iwamoto (JAEA).

Table 1: Journal and report publications for the measurements (1984-1997)

| Ref. | EXFOR | Reference | $\begin{aligned} & \text { INDC } \\ & \text { (JPN) } \end{aligned}$ | Lab. | standard ${ }^{+}$ | Remark* |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| [1] | 22089 | Y.Ikeda+,R,JAERI-1312,1988 | - | FNS | 93a(B5) |  |
| [2] | 22637 | C.Konno+, R,JAERI-1329.1993 | - | FNS | 93a(B5) |  |
| [3] | 22433 | Y.Kasugai+, J,ANE,25,23,1997 | - | OKT | B5* | (n,p) |
| [4] | 22434 | Y.Kasugai+, J,ANE,25,1485,1998 | - | OKT | B5* | $(\mathrm{n}, \alpha)$ |
| [5] | N/A | Y.Kasugai+, R,JAERI-R-2001-025,2001 | - | FNS | 93a(B5) |  |
| [6] | 22662 | H.Sakane+, J,ANE,28,1175,2001 | - | OKT | B5* | ( $\mathrm{n}, 2 \mathrm{n}$ ) |
| [7] | 22800 | H.Sakane+, J,ANE,29,53,2002 | - | OKT | B5* | (n,np) |
| [8] | 22809 | H.Sakane+, J,ANE,29,1209,2002 | - | FNS | B6 |  |
| [9] | 22827 | H.Sakane+, J,ANE,30,1847,2003 | - | FNS | B6 |  |
| [10] | 23011 | Y.Kasugai+, J,NST,31,1248,1994 | - | OKT | 93b | Ta,W (LL) |
| [11] | 22860 | K.Kawade+, J,NIM/A,496,183,2003 | - | OKT | B5 | no data |
| [12] | 22156 | T.Katoh+,R,JAERI-M-89-083,1989 | 124 | OKT | B5 | spsdd by [3,4,6,7]. 7 reactions are to be finalized. |
| [13] | 22187 | K.Kawade+,R,JAERI-M-90-171,1990 | 141 | OKT | B5 | spsdd by |


|  |  |  |  |  |  | [3,4,6,7,18] |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| [14] | 22215 | T.Kobayashi+,S,JAERI-M-91-032,265,1991 | 148 | OKT | B5 | spsdd by [15] |
| [15] | 22281 | K.Kawade+,R,JAERI-M-92-020,1992 | 154 | OKT | B5 | partly spsdd by [ $3,4,6,7$ ], 1 reaction is to be finalized |
| [16] | 22351 | Y.Kasugai+,S,JAERI-M-93-046,277,1993 | 163 | OKT | B5 | partly spsdd by [10,20], 4 reactions are to be finalized |
| [17] | N/A | Y.Kasugai+,R,JAERI-M-93-124,1993 | 165 | OKT | B5 | spsdd by $[3,4,6,7]$ |
| [18] | 22363 | K.Yamauchi+,S,JAERI-M-94-019,253,1994 | 169 | OKT | B5 | partly spsdd by [3,7], 3 reactions are to be finalized |
| [19] | 22365 | Y.Satoh+,S,JAERI-C-95-008,189,1995 | 173 | OKT | B5 | partly spsdd by [6,7,20], 3 reacs are to be finalized. |
| [20] | 22311 | S.Murahira+,S,JAERI-C-96-008,171,1996 | 175 | OKT | B5 | Partly spsdd by [6,7]. 6 reactions are to be finalized |
| [21] | 22348 | H.Sakane+, S,JAERI-C-97-004,193,1996 | 178 | OKT | B5* | $\begin{aligned} & \text { spsdd by } \\ & {[7,25]} \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ |
| [22] | 22340 | H.Sakane+,S,JAERI-C-97-005,263,1996 | 179 | OKT | B5* | spsdd by $[6,25]$ |
| [23] | 22428 | H.Sakane+,S,JAERI-C-98-003,318,1998 | 180 | OKT | B5* |  |
| [24] | 22415 | Y.Kasugai+,S,JAERI-M-92-027,268,1991 | 157 | OKT | B5 | spsdd by [17] |
| [25] | 22391 | H.Sakane+,C.97TRIEST, 1,619,1997 | - | OKT | B5 | To be finalized (all) |
| [26] | 22187 | T. Yamada+,S,JAERI-M-90-025,251,1990 | 136 | OKT | B5 | $\begin{aligned} & \text { spsdd by } \\ & {[3,4,6,7]} \end{aligned}$ |

+ Parenthesized symbol gives the secondary reference. The abbreviations mean
Short-lived products
B5: ${ }^{27} \mathrm{Al}(\mathrm{n}, \alpha){ }^{24} \mathrm{Na}$ in ENDF/B-V (R. Kinsey)
$\mathrm{B} 5 *:{ }^{27} \mathrm{Al}(\mathrm{n}, \alpha)^{24} \mathrm{Na}$ in ENDF/B-V (ENDF/B-VI in literature is not correct.)
B6: ${ }^{27} \mathrm{Al}(\mathrm{n}, \alpha)^{24} \mathrm{Na}$ in ENDF/B-VI (P.F. Rose)
Long-lived products
93a: ${ }^{93} \mathrm{Nb}(\mathrm{n}, 2 \mathrm{n})^{92} \mathrm{Nb}, 464 \mathrm{mb} \pm 4.2 \%$ (constant between 13.3 to 15.0 MeV )
93b: ${ }^{93} \mathrm{Nb}(\mathrm{n}, 2 \mathrm{n}){ }^{92} \mathrm{Nb}$ in D.R. Nethaway, J. Inorg. Nucl. Chem. 40(1978) 1285
* "spsdd" means superseded by the authors.

Table 2. Latest data sets and corresponding superseded (or withdrawn) data sets
(See Table 3 for definitions of flags.)

| Latest data | Flag | Previous data (1) | Flag | Previous data (2) | Flag |
| :---: | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 22156.005 | $*$ |  |  |  |  |
| 22156.012 | $*$ |  |  |  |  |
| 22156.017 | $*$ |  |  |  |  |
| 22156.018 | $*$ |  |  |  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |  |


| 22156.019 | * |  |  |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 22156.020 | * |  |  |  |  |
| 22281.003 | * |  |  |  |  |
| 22311.002 | * |  |  |  |  |
| 22311.011 | * |  |  |  |  |
| 22311.013 | * |  |  |  |  |
| 22311.005 | * | 22365.007 | z |  |  |
| 22311.007 | * | 22365.009 | Z |  |  |
| 22311.014 | * | 22365.012 | X | 22351.008 | $\mathrm{x}, \mathrm{g}$ |
| 22351.003 | * |  |  |  |  |
| 22351.005 | * |  |  |  |  |
| 22351.006 | * |  |  |  |  |
| 22351.007 | * |  |  |  |  |
| 22363.003 | *, h | 22187.007 | w, e |  |  |
| 22363.004 | *,i |  |  |  |  |
| 22363.005 | *, ${ }^{\text {d }}$ |  |  |  |  |
| 22365.002 | * |  |  |  |  |
| 22365.003 | * |  |  |  |  |
| 22365.013 | * |  |  |  |  |
| 22391.002 | *,1,m | 22340.010 | x |  |  |
| 22391.003 | *, $1, \mathrm{~m}$ | 22340.003 | X |  |  |
| 22391.004 | *,m | 22340.002 | X |  |  |
| 22391.005 | *,m | 22348.002 | X |  |  |
| 22391.006 | *,m | 22348.004 | X |  |  |
| 22391.007 | *,m | 22348.003 | X |  |  |
| 22391.008 | *,m | 22348.006 | X |  |  |
| 22391.009 | *,m | 22340.004 | X | 22348.008 | X |
| 22391.010 | *,m | 22340.007 | X |  |  |
| 22391.011 | *,m | 22348.007 | X |  |  |
| 22391.012 | *,m | 22348.009 | X |  |  |
| 22391.013 | *,m | 22340.008 | X |  |  |
| 22433.002 |  | 22281.002 | X |  |  |
| 22433.003 | o | 22187.004 | y |  |  |
| 22433.004 |  | 22281.005 | X |  |  |
| 22433.005 | 0 | 22187.008 | y |  |  |
| 22433.006 |  | 22281.007 | X |  |  |
| 22433.007 | O | 22187.009 | y |  |  |
| 22433.008 | O | 22187.010 | y |  |  |
| 22433.009 |  | 22281.008 | X |  |  |
| 22433.010 | 0 | 22156.007 | y,a |  |  |
| 22433.011 | 0 | 22156.008 | y |  |  |
| 22433.012 | 0 | 22156.009 | y |  |  |
| 22433.013 | 0 | 22187.012 | y, c |  |  |
| 22433.014 | O | 22187.014 | y,c |  |  |
| 22433.015 |  | 22281.015 | X |  |  |


| 22433.016 | o | 22156.011 | y |  |  |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| 22433.017 | 0 | 22156.014 | y |  |  |
| 22433.018 |  | 22415.002 | y |  |  |
| 22433.019 |  | 22415.003 | y |  |  |
| 22433.020 |  | 22415.005 | y |  |  |
| 22433.021 |  | 22415.007 | y |  |  |
| 22433.022 |  | 22415.009 | y |  |  |
| 22433.023 |  | 22415.012 | y |  |  |
| 22433.024 |  | 22281.017 | x |  |  |
| 22433.025 |  | 22415.014 | y |  |  |
| 22433.026 | p | 22415.017 | y |  |  |
| 22433.027 | q | 22415.018 | x,n | 22363.009 | x,k |
| 22433.028 |  | 22415.016 | y |  |  |
| 22434.002 | r,s | 22281.004 | x,f | 22187.002 | y |
| 22434.003 | r | 22187.005 | y |  |  |
| 22434.004 | r | 22156.004 | y |  |  |
| 22434.005 |  | 22281.010 | x |  |  |
| 22434.006 | r | 22156.010 | y |  |  |
| 22434.007 |  | 22281.011 | X |  |  |
| 22434.008 |  | 22281.012 | X |  |  |
| 22434.009 |  | 22187.015 | y |  |  |
| 22434.010 |  | 22281.014 | x |  |  |
| 22434.011 |  | 22187.016 | y |  |  |
| 22434.012 |  | 22415.006 | y |  |  |
| 22434.013 |  | 22415.015 | y |  |  |
| 22662.002 | t | 22156.002 | y |  |  |
| 22662.003 |  | 22156.003 | y |  |  |
| 22662.004 |  | 22156.006 | y |  |  |
| 22662.006 |  | 22340.009 | X |  |  |
| 22662.007 |  | 22281.013 | X |  |  |
| 22662.008 |  | 22156.013 | y |  |  |
| 22662.009 |  | 22415.013 | x |  |  |
| 22662.010 |  | 22187.018 | y, c | 22156.016 | y |
| 22662.011 |  | 22187.017 | y |  |  |
| 22662.012 |  | 22311.003 | X | 22365.005 | x |
| 22662.013 |  | 22311.004 | X | 22365.006 | X |
| 22662.014 |  | 22311.006 | X | 22365.008 | X |
| 22662.015 |  | 22311.008 | X |  |  |
| 22662.016 |  | 22311.010 | X | 22365.010 | X |
| 22662.017 |  | 22311.009 | X | 22365.011 | X |
| 22662.018 |  | 22340.006 | X |  |  |
| 22662.019 |  | 22340.005 | x |  |  |
| 22800.002 |  | 22363.002 | y | 22187.003 | x,c,d |
| 22800.003 |  | 22281.006 | X |  |  |
| 22800.004 | u | 22187.006 | y |  |  |


| 22800.005 | u | 22187.011 | y |  |  |
| :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- | :--- |
| 22800.006 |  | 22281.009 | x |  |  |
| 22800.007 | u | 22187.013 | y |  |  |
| 22800.008 |  | 22281.016 | x |  |  |
| 22800.009 | 22363.006 | y | 22156.015 |  |  |
| 22800.010 | 22363.007 | y |  | x |  |
| 22800.012 | 22415.008 | x |  |  |  |
| 22800.013 | 22363.008 | y | 22415.010 |  |  |
| 22800.014 | 22415.011 | x |  |  |  |
| 22800.015 | 22365.004 | x |  |  |  |
| 22800.016 | 22348.005 | x |  |  |  |
| 22800.017 | 22311.012 | x |  |  |  |
| 22800.018 | 22365.014 | x |  |  |  |
| 23011.002 | 22351.002 | x |  |  |  |
| 23011.003 | 22351.004 | x |  |  |  |
| 23011.004 | 22351.009 | x |  |  |  |
| 23011.006 | 22351.010 | x |  |  |  |

Table 3. Explanation of Flags in Table 2.

| \# | EXFOR \# | Remarks |
| :---: | :---: | :---: |
| a | 22156.007 [12] | (SPSDD, 22433011) $\rightarrow$ (SPSDD, 22433010) |
| b | 22156.015 [12] | It is superseded by 22800.009 [7]. They are from two independent measurements, but (1) their results agree within the error bars, and (2) the contribution of [12] to the weighted mean is small. |
| c | 22187.012,014,018 [13] | $\mathrm{En}=14.02 \mathrm{MeV} \rightarrow 14.01 \mathrm{MeV}$ |
| d | 22187.003 [13] | 3 data points ( $14.02,14.35$ and 14.64 MeV ) are tabulated in Table 3 of [26] but they have no relation with this reaction, and should be deleted. |
| e | 22187.007 [13] (1 pt) | This data point is withdrawn due to poor statistics. |
| f | 22281.004 [15] | En is not correct. The correct value is given in Table 5 of [4]. Consequently 22281.004 becomes perfect duplication of 22434.002, and must be deleted. |
| g | 22351.008 [16] (6 pts) | The final publication is under preparation. |
| h | 22363.003 [18] (5 pts) | The final publication is under preparation. |
| i | 22363.004 [18] (6 pts) | The final publication is under preparation. |
| j | 22363.005 [18] (6 pts) | The final publication is under preparation. |
| k | 22363.009 [18] | All data points are withdrawn except for 3.51 mb at 14.87 MeV . |
| 1 | $22391.002-003$ [25] | 1 data point at 13.88 MeV in [22] is missing due to mistake. |
| m | 22391.002-013 [25] | The final publication is under preparation. |
| n | 22415.018 [24] | All data points are withdrawn except for 5.4 mb at 14.87 MeV . |
| o | $\begin{aligned} & 22433003,005, \\ & 007-008, \\ & 010-014, \\ & 016-017[3] \\ & \hline \end{aligned}$ | $\mathrm{En}=14.02 \mathrm{MeV} \rightarrow 14.01 \mathrm{MeV}$ |
| p | 22433.026 [3] | Add one data point ( $13.65 \mathrm{MeV} \sigma=3.50 \mathrm{mb}, \delta_{\mathrm{e}}=6.4 \%, \delta_{\mathrm{r}}=5.1 \%$, $\delta_{\mathrm{t}}=8.0 \%$ ) |
| q | 22433.027 [3] | Weighted mean of two data points at 14.87 MeV in 22363.009 and 22415.018. Note that $\mathrm{I}_{y}(311 \mathrm{keV})$ in the EXFOR entry must be changed from $97.95 \%$ to $0.99 \%$ (See the errata). It is now 1.716\% (NDS1 10(2009)2945). |
| r | 22434 002-004,006 [4] | En $=14.02 \mathrm{MeV} \rightarrow 14.01 \mathrm{MeV}$ |
| S | 22434.002 [4] | Table 5 of [4] is not correct for this reaction except for the En values. The final values of ( $\sigma, \delta_{\mathrm{e}}, \delta_{\mathrm{r}}$ ) must be copied from Table 9(a) of [15] (=22281.004). Note that En of Table 9(a) is not correct. En "Set 2 " is wrongly printed instead of En "Set 1 ". (See Fig. 1 of [4] for Set 1 and Set 2). |
| t | 22662.002 [6] | $\sigma=5.48 \mathrm{mb} \rightarrow 5.84 \mathrm{mb}$ at $14.01 \mathrm{MeV}(=22156.002)$ |
| u | 22800 004-005,007 [7] | $\mathrm{En}=14.02 \mathrm{MeV} \rightarrow 14.01 \mathrm{MeV}$ |
| w | $\begin{aligned} & 22156.015[12] \\ & 22187.007 \end{aligned}$ | withdrawn |
| x | many | superseded (SPSDD must be added) |
| y | many | superseded (SPSDD already coded) |
| z | 22365.007, 009 [19] | duplication (must be deleted) |
| * | many | to be finalized in journal publications |

